

MINUTES
OF THE CITY OF MURFREESBORO
HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
City Hall, 111 W. Vine Street, Council Chambers

March 21, 2023 3:30PM

Members Present:

Bill Jakes, Chair
Jeff Davis, Vice-Chair
Linda Anderson
Gib Backlund
David Becker
Marimae White

Members Absent:

Deborah Belcher
Jim Thompson
Chase Salas

Staff Present:

Matthew Blomeley, Assistant Planning Director
Amelia Kerr, Planner
Roman Hankins, Assistant City Attorney
Ashley Fulghum, Recording Assistant

1. Call to Order:

Chair Bill Jakes called the meeting to order and determined that a quorum was present.

2. Consideration of Minutes:

Mr. David Becker moved to approve the minutes of the February 21, 2023 Historic Zoning Commission meeting with a correction to be made; the motion was seconded by Ms. Linda Anderson and was carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson
Gib Backlund
David Becker
Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

3. New Business:

a. Application [H-23-002] 324 East College Street, John & Laura Vanzandt- Requesting review for the construction of a new two-story detached garage and additional fencing.

Ms. Amelia Kerr presented the Staff Comments regarding this item, a copy of which is maintained in the permanent files of the Planning Department and is incorporated into these minutes by reference.

The applicants, Mr. John Vanzandt and Ms. Laura Vanzandt, were present to answer questions.

1. Exterior material- Cedar Nichiboard.

Chair Jakes inquired about the Nichiboard. Mr. Vanzandt responded that it is just a different brand of hardy board.

Chair Jakes asked the applicant if they knew what the reveal would be. They responded that it would be 8 ¼”.

Ms. Anderson inquired about the color. Mr. Vanzandt replied that they intend to repaint the house a cream color and the garage would be a similar shade.

Mr. Gib Backlund asked if the material on the side of the house is stucco. Mr. Vanzandt confirmed that it is.

Mr. Becker moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Ms. Anderson and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

2. Precision Millworks series 200 wood double hung windows.

Chair Jakes asked if the windows were made of a wood composite or a solid wood. Mr. Vanzandt replied that the windows are a solid wood, and the frame has some composite wood.

Chair Jakes inquired about the number of windows. Mr. Vanzandt responded that there are two double windows visible from the street.

Mr. Backlund moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Jeff Davis and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

3. Oakridge Estate Gray architectural shingles.

Chair Jakes inquired about how the proposed shingles compared to the ones on the house. Mr. Vanzandt responded that the shingle color is as close as they could match.

Mr. Backlund moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Mr. Becker and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

4. Wood-stained metal garage door.

Mr. Vanzandt stated that the door is metal with a wood painted texture.

Ms. Anderson inquired about metal doors as opposed to wooden ones in the Historic District. Chair Jakes responded that the Commission had approved metal garage doors in the past.

Vice-Chair Davis moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Ms. Marimae White and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

5. Garage exterior lighting fixtures.

Chair Jakes asked if all the lighting fixtures on the garage would be matching. Mr. Vanzandt confirmed that they would be.

Ms. Anderson moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Davis and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

6. Remove and replace existing chain-link fencing and add additional yard fencing with wood picket fencing.

The Commission, Staff and Mr. Vanzandt discussed which parts of the fencing were to be replaced and added.

Mr. Backlund moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Mr. Becker and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

The applicants requested to add an additional item for approval. Due to the item not being included in the notice, this request was denied.

Mr. Becker inquired about the height of the garage in comparison to the house. Mr. Vanzandt responded that they would be the same height.

Mr. Backlund asked if the applicant knew the height of the house. Mr. Vanzandt responded that he did not know. Mr. Backlund replied that according to the guidelines, new construction must be proportionate to the existing structure. Mr. Vanzandt responded that the height of the garage is within the guidelines, according to his architect.

b. Application [H-23-003] 137 Cherry Lane, John & Peggy Taylor- Requesting review for exterior remodel of an existing single-family dwelling.

Ms. Amelia Kerr presented the Staff Comments regarding this item, a copy of which is maintained in the permanent files of the Planning Department and is incorporated into these minutes by reference.

The applicant, Mr. John Taylor, was present at the meeting. His son, Mr. John Taylor Jr., was also present.

Ms. Jennifer Thibodeaux and Mr. Andy Englehart, of Englehart Construction, spoke as representatives for the applicants.

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

1. Replacement of existing wood and vinyl windows with ViWin Tech-6000 series windows with 7/8" simulated divided lights.

Chair Jakes inquired if the windows had already been replaced. Mr. Andy Englehart confirmed that they had been.

Chair Jakes asked the representatives to explain how the windows were chosen. Mr. Englehart stated that they were chosen to keep the original look of the home intact, while being operable.

Mr. Englehart stated that the window frames were left, and the sashes were replaced. The wooden frames were repaired and wrapped in aluminum cladding.

Vice-Chair Davis inquired about the material of the original windows. Mr. Englehart stated that they were all wood. Ms. Jennifer Thibodeaux further explained that the home had both wooden and vinyl windows.

Vice-Chair Davis asked when the home was built. Ms. Kerr stated that it was built in the 1940s.

Vice-Chair Davis asked the representatives to clarify where the vinyl and wooden windows were located on the home. Mr. Englehart stated that all the windows on the front elevation were wooden. The vinyl replacement windows were on the sides and back of the home.

Mr. Backlund asked if the representatives lived in the home now. Mr. Englehart responded that he does not. Mr. Backlund asked who lives in the house. Mr. Englehart responded that no one does currently.

Chair Jakes voiced his concerns over the use of vinyl in the windows.

Mr. Becker asked why the homeowners did not come before the Commission prior to starting the work. Mr. Englehart claimed that they did not know they had to.

Ms. Anderson raised concerns about the Commission granting forgiveness to homeowners instead of enforcing the rules. She cited examples of homeowners, on Cherry Lane, that went through the proper channels. She also cited examples of when the Commission required homeowners to remove unapproved work.

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

Mr. Englehart stated that other homes in the neighborhood appear to have similar windows to the ones installed in the applicant's home. This led him to believe that the windows chosen were appropriate.

Mr. Backlund asked the homeowners if they knew the home was in the Historic District. Mr. John Taylor stated that he knew and had owned the home for twelve years.

Chair Jakes referenced the standards set by the National Parks Service. He stated that there were concessions for the side and back windows, but the front windows should not contain vinyl.

Mr. Backlund inquired about the cost of the front windows. Mr. Englehart responded that the whole window package cost \$30,000.

Ms. Anderson asked Mr. Taylor if he received any information about the Historic District. Mr. Taylor responded that he did not look at the information.

Ms. Marimae White inquired if a window had been added. The applicants responded that a window had been moved, but the number of windows remained the same.

Mr. Backlund spoke about the guidelines set forth by the National Park Service and the City of Murfreesboro.

Mr. Backlund moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Mr. Becker and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: Linda Anderson

2. Brick repair on left side of house for window replacement/realignment.

Chair Jakes asked the applicants how they intended to match the brick. Mr. Englehart replied that they would salvage brick and replace where needed.

The applicants presented the Commission with brick samples.

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

Ms. Anderson moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Mr. Backlund and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

3. Replace existing solid wooden front door with ¾ light door.

Chair Jakes inquired if the front door is original. Mr. Englehart responded that he believes it is.

Due to the applicants not providing a sample of a replacement door, the request was deferred.

4. Replace 4" white gutters with 6" bronze gutters.

Chair Jakes inquired about the size of the gutter. Mr. Englehart responded that the profile is the same, but the gutter is larger than the previous one.

Mr. Becker moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Ms. White and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

5. Replace fascia boards.

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

Chair Jakes inquired if all the facia boards were replaced or only as needed. Mr. Englehart replied that they were replaced as needed.

Mr. Backlund moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Davis and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

6. Remove the shutters.

Ms. Thibodeaux stated that the shutters were not original to the home.

Ms. Anderson moved to approve the request. The motion was seconded by Mr. Backlund and carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

Ms. Thibodeaux inquired about painting brick. Chair Jakes responded that the Commission does not have a say in paint color, but they do have a say if the brick has never been painted.

4. Staff Reports and Other Business

Ms. Kerr introduced a new member of the Planning Staff, Ms. Ashley Fulghum, to the Commission.

Ms. Kerr also gave the Commission an update on the Historic District mailout.

MURFREESBORO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 21, 2023

5. Adjourn

Vice-Chair Davis motioned to adjourn the meeting; the motion was seconded by Mr. Backlund and was carried by the following vote:

Aye: Linda Anderson

Gib Backlund

David Becker

Vice-Chair Jeff Davis

Chair Bill Jakes

Marimae White

Nay: None

CHAIRMAN OR CO-CHAIRMAN

SECRETARY